

**MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF COUNTY ROAD COMMISSIONERS
MONROE, MICHIGAN
April 13, 2015**

1. At a Regular Meeting of the Board of County Road Commissioners at their offices located at 840 S. Telegraph Road, Monroe, Michigan on Monday, April 13, 2015 the meeting was called to order by Chairman Iacoangeli at 5:30 p.m.

2. Roll Call by Deputy Clerk as follows:

<u>PRESENT</u>	<u>EXCUSED</u>
Londo	None
Stammer	
Pace	
Minton	
Iacoangeli	

A quorum being present, the Board proceeded to transact business.

3. Commissioner Iacoangeli led the Pledge of Allegiance.

4. Commissioner Iacoangeli led the Silent Prayer.

5. Commissioner Pace moved, seconded by Commissioner Stammer to approve the April 13, 2015 regular meeting agenda as amended. Motion carried.

Add: #10[1] Approve the purchase of three (3) pick-up trucks through MiDeal program.

#10[2] Authorize the repair of MCRC Gradall in the amount of \$44,581.95 to AIS Construction Equipment Repair.

Vote: Ayes: 5 Nays: 0 Excused: 0 Abstain: 0 Motion carried.

6. SITE PLAN APPEAL HEARING

Commissioner Iacoangeli opened the hearing at 5:33 p.m.

Legal Counsel, Phil Costello, indicated the Engineering Department provided a memo explaining Mr. Quatro's request for an appeal hearing with regards to the driveway access off Stewart Road.

Mr. Assenmacher indicated the packet of information put together by Ross Brown highlights the history of the location along with a summary of the driveway options and recommendation from the Engineering Department. Due to potential stacking concerns at the intersection, the recommendation to limit movement from the approach is for safety reasons for the motoring public. The eastbound section of Stewart Road at the Telegraph Road intersection will be receiving improvements in conjunction with the La-Z-Boy Chair traffic.

Commissioner Londo asked if there were any eastbound/westbound traffic surveys done for La-Z-Boy traffic. Mr. Assenmacher stated there were studies done for existing traffic and proposed traffic as outlined in the plans and road improvements. Due to the close proximity to the intersection of Stewart Road at Telegraph Road and the stacking that does and will continue to occur for left turns onto Telegraph Road, left turning improvements out from the Quatro approach would be very challenging at time and could be potentially dangerous.

Mr. Todd Quatro, owner of property/Quatro Construction, indicated he was not at odds with the engineering analysis. The potential tenant, Qdoba, is arguing with the limited approach recommended on Stewart Road. They have already been restricted by the approach on Telegraph from MDOT. A plan was worked out with Burger King to combine the entrances and it was turned down by MDOT. MDOT is keeping the pork-chop entrance off Telegraph - right in and right out only. When the tenant was made aware of the limited entrance on Stewart Road, they pulled out.

Mr. Quatro suggested putting up NO LEFT TURN signs instead of requiring the island. The tenant feels the recommended entrance will restrict the flow of traffic in and out of the site which would negatively affect their business.

Mr. Quatro indicated they wanted to improve the site for more maneuverability which would improve site distance concerns. He has an engineering background and doesn't feel the pork chop requirement by MDOT makes it any safer as people will ignore it and turn left when the opportunity allows. When and if people get tired of waiting to turn left due to large volume of traffic, they will eventually turn right.

Commissioner Iacoangeli agreed with Mr. Quatro's comments but also indicated we can't control what people do but make the best decisions to keep the motoring public safe. In his experience, he has been involved with many nasty accidents at intersections and he would hate to contribute by not putting safety concerns first.

Mr. Quatro indicated he lost other tenants (Aspen Dental and AT&T) due to similar complications. He doesn't feel the driveway that is there will create any safety issues.

Commissioner Iacoangeli stated he would think any business would want their customers to have a good experience, which includes safety in and out of their business.

Mr. Quatro stated his family operated their business 42 years from that location and never had a problem. He agreed during peak hours there is a lot of traffic, but during non-peak hours the traffic is nothing. He felt he had to appear before the Board to ask for an exception since his potential tenant (Qdoba) needs maneuver-availability for their delivery trucks.

Commissioner Pace was familiar with the area and that traffic has increased over the years due to other developments in the area. The Road Commission's priority is to keep the roads safe, but not necessarily inconvenient for businesses. He asked if time restrictions could be placed at this location to help in monitoring traffic and left turns.

Mr. Assenmacher said the concern is compliance since so many drivers disregard the postings. He understands Mr. Quatro's concerns as well.

Commissioner Pace understands the Road Commission's recommendation to install an island to keep people from wanting to turn left in order to keep the traveling public safe.

Commissioner Minton asked if the access could be changed at a later date. His concerns were that a good business owner was trying to develop his property to put people to work and it appeared there are numerous roadblocks that make it more difficult. He questioned whether the Road Commission could monitor the intersection and address safety at a later date if warranted.

Mr. Assenmacher stated anything is possible, but it would not be the recommendation since there would be no incentive to address safety in the future. This is a risk management issue and based on the increased level of risk associated with the approach and geometrics, the concerns should be addressed now. He would be willing to listen to any ideas and the engineering department makes every attempt to work with people to solve issues.

Mr. Quatro stated everyone he has worked with at the Road Commission has been very cooperative. He explained the suggestions he had to MDOT regarding the driveway with neighbor Burger King to smooth traffic flow, and it was rejected. Qdoba is basically concerned about getting their delivery trucks in the driveway.

Mr. Assenmacher was unaware of the conversation with MDOT and asked for the ability to talk with MDOT to determine their reason for rejecting the suggestion and explain the overall impact.

Commissioner Minton thought it unusual that Qdoba was more concerned about their delivery trucks than their customer's safety. He asked if Mr. Quatro felt his anchor was completely gone. Mr. Quatro stated the project was on hold unless he can deliver the site.

Commissioner Pace suggested postponing the decision until the next meeting to allow Mr. Assenmacher the ability to speak with MDOT.

Commissioner Stammer asked about eliminating the island and using pavement marking instead. Mr. Assenmacher indicated pavement marking would be a monitoring challenge as it is only marking the road and would need to be maintained annually. A more permanent solution such as a raised curb island would be more permanent.

Mr. Quatro explained it is a highly visible corner and it wasn't good to let it set vacant. He added he could rent it using the existing entrances. He wanted to update and push the building(s) away from corner, which is a lot of work. He is just trying to serve the greater good.

Commissioner Londo summed up that Mr. Quatro was asking for common sense to prevail and overrule the bureaucrats. Mr. Quatro said yes.

Commissioner Londo moved, seconded by Commissioner Minton to postpone the appeal decision to the April 27, 2015 regular meeting. Vote: Ayes: 5 Nays: 0 Motion carried.

7. Public Comment –

David Hoffman, County Commissioner, again voiced a concern for the need to install a light at Telegraph north Buhl just north of Grafton Road. He stated there are safety issues and he would like to see if emergency grant monies are available. He feels there are too many accidents there, and he is tired of scraping up bodies. He would like to see a couple of lights because the corridor is so dark, especially in front of the bar and one in front of the party store. The can continues to be kicked down the road.

Mr. Hoffman also inquired about the options for Plank Road. He attended the workshop and thought the Board was going to discuss it at this meeting. He would like to see the first stretch of Plank Road get tackled this year. He said time is ticking and wants to see something get started soon.

James Morgan, MCRC Drainage Crew Leader, stated he had concerns about the Gradall repair agenda item and asked that his input be allowed. He stated this is an older machine (1994) and he operated this machine in the past. It is a 21-year machine that has been overhauled in the past and questioned the reasoning behind spending \$44,000 to repair this machine when monies were set aside in the budget to purchase a new one. The other Gradall machine is 15-years old. He voiced a high concern for the future of the Gradall program. He is not totally against repairing the machine but was concerned.

Mr. Morgan explained the Gradall program brings in money from the townships, which takes people off Act 51 under the cost sharing program. He provided information on how much money the Gradall program has contributed to the Road Commission efforts. He added that excess Gradall is paid 100% by the townships. He took the Gradall program seriously because as any engineer will tell you the base of the roads affects drainage.

8. The following items were listed on the Consent Agenda: *(with immediate effect)*

1) Approval of Minutes- March 23, 2015 Regular Meeting Minutes

2) Approval of Journal Entry

No. 131 Vendor Checks # 66065-66100	\$ 280,606.96
No. 162 Payroll Checks #62621-62633 & Advice #16289-16368	\$ 224,536.69
No. 179 Vendor Checks #66101-66167	\$ 257,768.48
No. 190 Payroll Checks #62634-62643 & Advice #16369-16447	\$ 217,898.38
Cafeteria Plan Pmts, 1 st qtr 2015	\$ 13,563.90
Bank Service Charge – March 2015	\$ 89.85

3) Township Contracts

Whiteford Township

Section	Jeffs to US 23	Single seal, Zone patch
Roloff	Sylvania Petersburg to Turk	Single seal, Zone patch
Lakeview	Creque to Head-O-Lake	Single seal, Zone patch
Head-O-Lake patch	Temperance to Memorial Hwy	Single seal, Zone
Creque	Memorial Highway to US 223	Single seal, Zone patch
Sylvania Petersburg	Sterns to Consear	Single seal, Zone patch
Tabbert	US 223 to Goertz	Single seal
Temperance Patch	Whiteford to Whiteford Center	Single Seal, OBC, Zone
Yankee	Clark to Memorial Highway	Single seal, Pvmt Marking
2015 Local Roads - Mowing		

4) Award bid for 2015 Primary Roadside Mowing to KBK Landscaping, Inc. and authorize the Managing Director to sign the contract on behalf of the Board.

5) Approve the Resolution to post the structure carrying Redman Road over North Macon Creek, Milan Township, Monroe County, Michigan as follows:

- One Unit Gross Weight Limit 42 Tons
- Two Unit Gross Weight Limit 60 Tons
- Three Unit Gross Weight Limit 73 Tons

6) Approve the Resolution to post the structure carrying Vivian Road over Sandy Creek, Frenchtown Charter Township, Monroe County, Michigan as follows:

- One Unit Gross Weight Limit 42 Tons
- Two Unit Gross Weight Limit 54 Tons
- Three Unit Gross Weight Limit 66 Tons

7) Approve and sign the Drainage Covenant with DTE Electric, Frenchtown Charter Township, Monroe County, Michigan.

8) Approve and sign the Resolution for the removal and replacement of the structure which carries Drew Street over Swan Creek, Berlin Charter Township, Monroe County, Michigan; and authorize the Chairman and Vice Chairman to sign contracts on behalf of the Board.

9) Authorize the Managing Director to enter into as needed surveyor services through an agreement with Rolf W. Goerlich, P.S. for the 2015 construction season.

10) Approve updated Purchasing Policy #2012-31.

11) Award bid for 2015 Calcium Chloride to Liquid Calcium Chloride Sales, Inc.

Commissioner Pace moved, seconded by Commissioner Minton to approve the April 13, 2015 Consent Agenda as presented. Vote: Ayes: 5 Nays: 0 Motion carried.

9. Unfinished Business – None.

10. New Business –

1) Approve the purchase of three (3) pick-up trucks through the MiDeal program.

Mr. Pierce explained that two (2) pick-up trucks and one (1) utility vehicle were approved in the capital budget. He felt the Road Commission would be better served to purchase three (3) pick-up trucks.

Commissioner Stammer asked if the breakdown included undercoating. Mr. Pierce explained that per Board policy all new vehicles are to be undercoated and it would be done locally, and then touched up annually. Plows and lights would be added aftermarket.

Commissioner Pace asked where the money was coming from for the extra pick-up, wanting to make sure it wasn't coming from the money set aside to purchase a Gradall. Mr. Pierce explained \$90,000 was budgeted for two pick-ups and one utility vehicle, but he is now asking that money be applied to purchase three (3) pick-up trucks.

Commissioner Londo inquired what vehicles were being replaced. Matt Purcell, maintenance Supervisor in the mechanics garage, indicated 2000, 2001 and 2004 models that have over 200,000 miles on them.

Commissioner Minton asked the reason for the third pick-up truck and what would be the real cost to outfit the trucks.

Mr. Pierce explained the three pick-ups would be 4-wheel drive, ¾ ton trucks that would be utilized in the winter by supervisors to assist with snow removal. He stated the Road Commission's concentration is snow removal in the winter months and these trucks would give the supervisors the ability to push snow from intersections with the front plow package to be more efficient. To have the trucks undercoated would cost approximately \$300 per vehicle and to outfit with front plow package would be about \$4,000 per truck, which would be included in the 2016 capital budget.

Commissioner Pace moved, seconded by Commissioner Stammer to approve the purchase of three (3) pick-up trucks from the MiDeal Program in the amount of \$27,495.40 each as recommended by Managing Director, Randy D. Pierce.

Roll Call Vote:

<u>AYE</u>	<u>NAY</u>
Dan Minton	None
Charles Londo	
Bruce R. Stammer, Jr.	
Stephen J. Pace	
Paul Iacoangeli	

Vote: Ayes: 5 Nays: 0 Excused: 0 Abstain: 0 Motion carried.

2) Authorize the repair of the MCRC Gradall in the amount of 44,581.95 to AIS Construction Equipment Repair.

Mr. Pierce informed the Board the Road Commission's fleet of vehicles is getting older and struggling with equipment. The 2015 budget included \$300,000 in hopes of purchasing a new Gradall machine, but the costs came in over \$400,000.

In reviewing the options, the Road Commission contacted AIS and Supervisor Matt Purcell and the Gradall operator reviewed the proposed work and agreed it would be more beneficial to put the \$45K into this machine to get another 3-5 years out of the machine.

Mr. Pierce has also been in contact with Genesee County who may be selling their 2006 Gradall next year and has voiced an interest in purchasing that machine. He also informed the Board that as many as ten (10) snow trucks may not last due to their deteriorating condition.

Maintenance Supervisor Matt Purcell explained he talked with the Gradall operator and then reviewed the existing fleet to see what the Road Commission needed the most. The MCRC has a 2000 and 1994 Gradall. The operator of the 1994 Gradall (former mechanic) was convinced that it is a good machine but needed work. AIS suggested repairs and upon review those repairs reveal extending the life of that machine for another 3-5 years which would give the Road Commission time to review options to replace older equipment.

The Road Commission had 16 single axle trucks and is now down to 11 due to old age and poor shape. These trucks have in excess of 200,000 miles and are worn out. If you were to rate these trucks from 1 to 10 with 10 being the worse, these trucks would be a solid 9 because they are used a lot and worn out. The Road Commission also has a 1989 excavator.

Mr. Purcell explained that the construction equipment only runs a partial year, not all year round like a single or tandem axle truck. He took the number of hours on the machine, used 6 months and came up with an average of 4 hours per day that this machine is used. He felt the most practical thing would be to repair the Gradall based on the poor condition of the general fleet. He stated he considered the best over survival for the Road Commission equipment when making this recommendation. He also indicated he has talked with Genesee and it looking at getting the first option to buy their Gradall when they upgrade. At this point it is important to look at other priority items in order to get through next winter season. The majority of the Road Commission utility pick-up trucks are over 10 years old with almost 200,000 miles. The general consensus from the operator and AIS to spend \$45K and get up to 5 more years out of this Gradall which seems to be the best option at this time.

Commissioner Minton asked the last time the machine was overhauled. Mr. Purcell estimated 2004. He added that the machine is structurally sound.

Commissioner Pace asked if Jim Morgan wanted to add more comments as the crew leader. Commissioner Pace also asked why money was set aside for the possible purchase of a new Gradall if there is a bigger need for single axle trucks.

Mr. Pierce explained that when developing the budget \$300,000 was set aside for a Gradall, but never did he expect the price to come in over \$400,000. Money was also set aside for three (3) single axle trucks to start addressing the aging fleet. There are many needs but with this Board's desire to put snow removal as a high priority the fleet should be looked at more seriously.

Commissioner Pace stated he has always felt the Road Commission needed 50 trucks but understood the money was not available. He questioned whether the Road Commission could rent a Gradall for five (5) months instead of purchasing. Mr. Purcell indicated AIS would not rent a Gradall.

Commissioner Londo wanted to verify that the Gradall only worked an average of 4 hours per day. Mr. Purcell explained that based on the hours on the meter and using a 6 month time frame, the average came out to 4 hours per day. Again, he reminded the Board that this is a seasonal piece of equipment and some days it works longer and some days less. It is a piece of equipment that is weather dependent.

Commissioner Minton agreed with Commissioner Pace that the equipment is old and should be upgraded. He added that everyone would love new equipment but if maintenance can be done to extend the life of a piece of equipment at a reasonable price it should be done in order to best utilize the equipment we have. He would like to see a plan put together to replace equipment. He urged the staff to stop putting money in the budget to be “played” with as it was sending mixed messages. He asked that the staff be serious in developing a plan and stick with it. He asked the price of the Gradall from Genesee.

Mr. Purcell stated Genesee wouldn’t commit to a price, but said in the ball park of \$150,000 for their Gradall.

Mr. Pierce explained that when he developed a plan in 2005 which was given to the Managing Director at the time but it was not acted on. The question right now is what the priority is for the Road Commission. He doesn’t disagree that there is a need for a Gradall but in the short term we need to try to make our equipment stretch. Being a certified mechanic he has the advantage of knowing what to look for when reviewing the need for the fleet.

Money was set aside in the budget for a new Gradall, but everyone experienced sticker shock when the price came in over \$400,000. He stressed the fact that the budget was not fluffed, but when the time came it saved the Road Commission more money to fix than buy new. He stated he is trying to be a good steward of the Road Commission’s limited money.

Mr. Purcell added that in talking with other Road Commission’s, their 10-year replacement plan has turned into a 20-year replacement plan for equipment due to budget cuts and restraints. Every Road Commission is fighting the same battle.

Commissioner Pace asked if the Road Commission could compromise and purchase two single axles and buy a Gradall with payments. Mr. Pierce would need to check but thought payments would be possible.

Commissioner Londo indicated he had been on the Board since January and only heard how terrible the roads are and now is hearing the equipment is in dire need. It appears that we do a lot of piece meal – work session on the deplorable condition of Plank Road, Gradall needs to be replaced or repaired, and now hearing our trucks are also in bad shape, etc. His priority to is fix roads and would like to use any extra money to put on roads. He believes the Road Board has also indicated their priority is to fix or repair roads. If the Road Commission can buy five more years of service for the Gradall by investing \$45K, that would free up money to be put on roads. He also indicated he heard and agreed with Mr. Morgan that digging ditches for proper drainage is important. When they were interviewed by the County Commissioners, the priority from them was to fix roads also.

Commissioner Iacoangeli commended Mr. Pierce and Matt Purcell for the diligence in making the recommendation. He had similar experiences where the fire department set aside money for a new piece of equipment, but ended up refurbishing a piece of equipment that lasted another 15 years. To him it was a very wise course of action at this time. He felt the professional staff took the time to analyze all the options. He also indicated he appreciated Mr. Morgan’s comments.

Commissioner Londo moved, seconded by Commissioner Stammer to authorize the repair of the Gradall in the amount of \$44,581.95 to AIS Construction Equipment Repair.

Roll Call Vote:

<u>AYE</u>	<u>NAY</u>
Dan Minton	Stephen J. Pace
Charles Londo	
Bruce R. Stammer, Jr.	
Paul Iacoangeli	

Vote: Ayes: 4 Nays: 1 Excused: 0 Abstain: 0 Motion carried.

11. Report of Officers -

Randy Pierce (Managing Director/Superintendent of Maintenance)–Nothing additional to report.

Phillip C. Masserant (Director of Finance) – Mr. Masserant indicated Scot Hoskins would be at the next meeting for the audit presentation. The audit information was given to the Board for their review. He also indicated he would have a financial report through 3/31 prepared for the next regular meeting.

Michael L. Smith (Director of Operations) – Mr. Smith stated the HMA paving and crackfill bids are due. He also indicated that Bedford Township may add more projects to their list. The Road Commission will be renting a spray patcher and he will be monitoring the test results. Mr. Smith also indicated he prepared a memo to the Board on the Plank Road options and with their approval will schedule meetings with the townships.

Scott Assenmacher (County Highway Engineer) – Mr. Assenmacher stated the frost laws were lifted earlier in the day. He explained that federal dollars were in the TIP for seasonal weight signs on eligible federal aid roads. These signs will be flip signs that will be installed and left up year round which should save time and energy. He also updated the board on awards letters for two 2016 safety projects. One of the safety projects includes an experimental high friction surface which is an innovative way to get funding into Monroe County. This type of surface treatment is geared to reduce traffic accidents through friction control.

Philip Costello (General Counsel) – Nothing additional to report.

12. Public Comment -

Gary Williams, Local #543, asked why the Road Commission would put plows on the new pick-up trucks when we already have pick-ups with the front plows that haven't been used in 3-4 years. He inquired about the current plan to replace equipment. He also stated the 1989 is a back-up excavator and the track falls off and it should be looked at and possibly on the list to be replaced.

Mr. Williams stated that in the past the leadership replaced single axle trucks with tandems and there are more tandems in the fleet which is why the Road Commission is down to 11 single axle trucks.

Jerry Blanchette, Raisinville Township Supervisor, attended the MCRC workshop and believed the MCRC Board would be dealing with the Plank Road options at this meeting. He was hoping for a more definitive direction from the Board and was disappointed that it wasn't on the agenda. He hated to have to wait another 2 weeks and have this pushed down the road. He is waiting to approve their chip seals in anticipation of spending money on Plank Road.

Jim Morgan, Local #543, thanked the Board for their time in considering the Gradall. He stated he couldn't argue that the workers were in need of equipment. He didn't agree with the information presented saying the Gradall only works an average of 4 hours/day. He felt that was totally wrong and he wanted to voice a huge objection to that number. He explained that the Gradall will start approximately May 1st and run through freeze.

13. Commissioners' Comments -

Commissioner Pace stated he was glad that everyone could talk about tough questions and hoped no one took offense to his questions.

Commissioner Stammer agreed there is a lot of need but not a lot of funding available and we need to do the best we can to get by. The Road Commission has need for manpower and equipment and he hoped for best in the future.

Commissioner Londo inquired why the AFSMCE contract was not signed yet. He stated if the contract wasn't signed before the next Board meeting, action should be taken. He also asked if MDOT recently approved a light at the intersection that Mr. Hoffman was talking about.

The staff indicated the light was approved at Sigler Road. Mr. Pierce added that he has spoken to MDOT's Tom Simpson and they were not in favor on installing a light at the location referenced by Mr. Hoffman. MDOT is careful when installing lights on a state highway.

Commissioner Minton had nothing additional to report.

Commissioner Iacoangeli had nothing additional to report.

14. Adjournment -

Chairman Iacoangeli stated if there are no objections, the meeting is adjourned at 7:28 p.m.

Cheryl A. U'Ran

Cheryl A. U'Ran, Deputy Clerk